New Suns: Using YPAR with Black girls to combat misogynoiristic educational policies

Parker E. Foster, MA*
New York University Metropolitan Center for Research on Equity and the Transformation of Schools Affiliation

Among methods to engage youth in critical reflection processes, youth participatory action research (YPAR) is an emerging initiative, particularly with Black girls. While there are several published accounts of YPAR with Black students and YPAR with girls, there are few publications documenting YPAR with Black girls. This manuscript articulates the importance of centering Black girls in YPAR studies, outlining the benefits with a focus on punitive school discipline policies, issuing a call for more intentional inclusion and consideration of their needs with a goal of dismantling sexist and racist educational policies.

Keywords: Black girlhood, Black girls, youth participatory action research, misogynoir, education policy

Octavia Butler, Black female science fiction author, expressed in her unreleased novel, Parable of the Trickster, that there is nothing new under the sun, but that there are new suns. This belief in the persistent and ubiquitous possibility of innovation can be applied to the research approaches that scholars utilize to understand and illuminate Black girls’ experiences, ways of being, and methods of knowledge creation. When age-old social infirmities such as gendered racism, school pushout, and the results of anti-Black policies continue to plague Black girls’ educational and daily experiences, the solutions to these issues must be crafted under a new sun and viewed through a new lens.

Black girls of various age groups encounter simultaneous sexist and racist practices and policies in and out of schools while employing their own forms of resistance against these interlocking oppressions (Daniel & White, 2018). Many of these school-based policies result in exclusionary practices that are rooted in misogynoir, the anti-Black sexism that impacts Black women and girls in various societal contexts (Bailey, 2021). While Black girls are not inherently more disruptive, combative, or disobedient than their non-Black gender peers, they are punished more severely for similar infractions (Crenshaw, Ocen, & Nanda, 2015). Combating both structural racism and sexism, Black adolescent females experience the criminal punishment system differently than their racial or gender counterparts (Evans-Winters & Esposito, 2010). School discipline research demonstrates that Black girls are suspended and expelled from school...

Researchers, community members, and additional policy participants (educators, policymakers, and families) have much to learn from the profundity of Black girls who engage in participatory action research. The unique expertise that derives from their daily experiences should be lauded as invaluable knowledge. While strides have been made in the field of youth participatory action research (YPAR) as it relates to Black female participants, much is still unexplored. Furthering our collective understanding of Black girls through processes led by Black girls has implications for several fields, including sociology, educational policy studies, youth development studies, pedagogical approaches, gender studies, and many others.

This work serves as an urgent call to researchers to further explore Black girls’ understandings of their world(s) through youth participatory action research. I begin by reviewing existing YPAR theoretical and empirical literature featuring studies that focus on young, Black female co-researchers. Next, I turn to the criticality of YPAR and its potential outcomes for participating Black girls, highlighting their agency through experiential meaning-making, their ability to drive broader educational policy and social justice changes before discussing the policy implications associated with YPAR implementation. In this section, I focus these three arguments on the possibilities of dismantling harmful school discipline policies that target the gendered and racialized intersections of Black girls’ identities and how YPAR may serve as a helpful method of resistance. I conclude by considering recommendations for how best to incorporate Black girls in YPAR studies and position them as agents of change, using their knowledge to combat misogynoiristic policies and practices.

**Literature review: YPAR as epistemology and methodology**

Education research studies across numerous topics have centered Black girls including juvenile justice and school discipline discourse (Annamma et al., 2019; Crenshaw, Ocen, & Nanda, 2015; Hines-Datiri & Carter Andrews, 2017; Morris, 2016; Wun, 2015) and adolescent research (Epstein, Blake, & González, 2017; Scottham et al., 2008; Stokes et al., 2020). The extant literature on theoretical and empirical research illuminates their experiences, documenting how various social institutions either make room for or constrict their identities, further contributing to gendered racism. Unfortunately, the methodology and analysis employed in some studies about Black adolescent females have not provided Black girls with agency to define and understand themselves through analysis using their own lens. Joseph et al. (2016) argue that given the amount of studies that synonymize Black girls with negative, violent, or stereotypical characteristics, there is critical need for studies that focus on “the importance of Black adolescent females constructing meaning for themselves and resisting stereotypes and dominant discourses” (p. 9). This section highlights some of the existing YPAR literature and research studies on general practices, those centering Black adolescents, and studies specifically featuring young, Black girls as participants. Moreover, the discussion around these featured studies demonstrates the necessity of more expansive youth participatory research projects.

Youth participatory action research is a methodological and epistemological attempt in studies to shift Black girls from the roles of subjects and participants to co-researchers. Cammarota and Fine (2008) describe YPAR as a “radical epistemological challenge” to the belief that knowledge creation and value rests solely within academic institutions (p. 215). This research method provides young people with “opportunities to study social problems affecting
their lives and then determine actions to rectify these problems” (Cammarota & Fine, 2008, p. 2).

As such, for students with historically and contemporarily oppressed identities, YPAR serves as a way for them to create epistemological disruption regarding their daily experiences and topics that researchers attempt to understand. For Black girls who experience the interlocking oppressions of misogynoiristic policies and practices, this disruption can alter the impact these policies have on their educational journeys.

However, utilizing YPAR specifically with Black female students is still a budding field of research. Within existing YPAR literature, scholars have focused their projects on youth with various racial, linguistic, gender, and sexuality identities. Some studies that have employed participatory action research methods with Black students have not been gender-specific, working with both boys and girls. Hope et al. (2015) worked with eight Black students, six boys and two girls, to examine racial inequalities in their high schools in Michigan, particularly as it related to the students’ interpretations and perceptions of anti-Black discrimination. This study explored the students’ understandings of racial marginalization and its negative implications on their academic experiences. Participating students reported their treatment by various teachers, highlighting the underlying racial biases that seemed to influence the educators’ actions.

Furthermore, as students participated in this study, they engaged in critical reflection of their educational experiences. According to the authors, adolescence presents itself as an “opportune time to use newly developed abstract and higher order thinking skills to engage deeply in critical analysis and reflection on issues of race” (p. 102). Had this study been conducted solely with Black female participants, the implications might have provided them with the space to interrogate the interlocking racial- and gender-based oppression they faced in schools using their critical thinking skills. Given that Black girls are unable to filter their experiences through an ‘either-or’ binary of race or gender, their participation in this study could have positioned them to implement their recent understandings of marginalization to critique and better their educational spaces.

For studies that were gender specific, focusing on female youth participants of various races, Schaafsma et al. (1999) featured a racially mixed group of eighth grade girls in the Bronx who conducted an interdisciplinary research project on teenage sexuality and pregnancy. Sanchez (2009) organized a youth participation project with Latina immigrant youth to highlight the experiences of transnational Latinx families and their critique of the American school system. Among studies that were led by young women, Cahill (2008) created a study with participants, ages 16-22, of diverse racial and nationality backgrounds including participants’ self-described identities as Chinese, Puerto Rican, African-American, Dominican, and Black Latina. This project sought to explore the relationship between the changing racial and spatial landscape of their neighborhood, the Lower East Side of New York City, and the negative stereotypes of young women of color.

Very few studies solely engaged Black girls as co-researchers. Ault (2017) designed a study with Black girls at an urban high school in Northern California, the purpose of which was to examine their experiences with the school-to-prison pipeline and any resulting trauma. Davis (2019) recruited six 11th and 12th grade Black girls from a low-income Atlanta-based school to participate in a project that explored their knowledge of the educational pathway to STEM careers, especially for Black women. Duke and Fripp (2022) utilized their YPAR project with eight teenaged Black girls who attended charter schools to examine participants’ perceptions of internalized racial bias as they worked within a racially homogenous research team. Their goal
was to explore whether the girls’ beliefs about an all-Black female team would disrupt any societal biases participants may have internalized.

While these aforementioned studies provide great insight into the varied experiences and understandings of Black girls, they are also limited in their portrayal of young Black female experiences as the projects only operated with teenage or adolescent participants. Moreover, these studies engaged Black girls in urban settings, leaving rural educational experiences unexplored. Thus, there is an increased need to illustrate the nuanced experiences of elementary- and middle-school aged Black girls and those enrolled in non-urban schools.

These studies have contributed to the field of education research by broadening the research methodology and demonstrating that youth, especially Black girls, can create new suns under which to question social issues that plague their daily experiences while making new meaning of the intersectional oppression they face. This manuscript argues that YPAR as a research approach centers the insight and genius of Black girls and allows them to position their knowledge as expertise in an effort a) create experiential meaning making, b) challenge educational policies, and ultimately, c) create social change.

What can YPAR do for Black girls?

A heavily researched outcome of YPAR is the development of increased levels of critical consciousness among participants (Mitra & Serriere, 2012; Otis & Loeffler, 2006; Reich et al., 2015; Turner et al., 2013; Wagaman, 2015). Critical consciousness, as first expressed by Paolo Freire (1970), encompasses the transformative process where people not only become aware of the forces that seek to oppress them but consequently take action to resist and combat those forces and systems.

As Black girls understand themselves and their experiences, they can simultaneously elucidate the world around them and their place in it, thus advancing the development of their sociopolitical consciousness. During this process, it is important to highlight the joy that is integral to their experiences. There are many research methodologies and studies that employ a deficit perspective when exploring the impact of certain policies or practices on Black adolescent females (Joseph et al., 2016). As explained by Agger et al. (2022), an abundance of research centered on Black girls positions them as lacking, delinquent, or focuses on the negative outcomes associated with their identities and behaviors instead of explaining the contexts in which they develop. However, Black girls are not devoid of joy in their characterizations of themselves and their experiences. They need platforms that center them and their voices, and the necessary tools to advance their learning and better their worlds.

Experiential meaning-making

YPAR centers youth as experts on their daily experiences, contributing their perspectives to the various research processes, including framework selection, methods of data collection and analysis, and data interpretation. It can be an empowering tool that provides them with the space, words, and framing to interpret their everyday experiences. For Black girls who are susceptible to school pushout, and policing and punishing of their bodies and mannerisms, YPAR can aid them in supplying the language and space to interpret what they experience. They can define themselves, for themselves in the way of author, Audre Lorde and in the spirit of Black feminist Patricia Hill Collins who argued that Black girls and women must substitute prevalent negative
beliefs and images about themselves “with self-defined knowledge” that is “essential to [their] survival” (Collins, 2000, p. 100). Black girls in research aren’t subjects of inquiry to be prodded or have interpretation foisted upon them. Instead, through YPAR, they control their narratives. Black girls are aware of their educational, emotional, and social needs, particularly as it relates to punishment in schools. They may not know the specific statistics associated with over-policing, surveillance, and school pushout, but they can attest to their encounters with these phenomena which may lead to a more robust understanding of the solutions to these social ills (Morris, 2015; Watson & Nash, 2021).

When Black girls are presented with the opportunity to illuminate their worlds, they create “epistemic agency in ways that enable [researchers] to understand how best to meet their academic, emotional, and social needs” (Carter Andrews et al., 2019, p. 2544). Black girls are uniquely positioned to understand the manifestations of racism and sexism in school policies and its impact on them (Stokes et al., 2020).

For example, school dress code policies may be race-neutral in their structure, but are not immune to perpetuating misogynoir in their implementation where Black girls’ bodies, hair, dress, and methods of personal expression are punished more severely than their non-Black gender peers (Blake et al., 2015; Watson, 2016). Watson and Nash (2021) explained in their case study of a high school dress code that the subjective language featured in these policies leave Black girls at the mercy of school leaders’ interpretations which often reinforce whiteness, punishing those students who do not align with biased definitions of appropriate or professional physical appearance. By providing Black girls with the space to gather, interrogate, and analyze their experiences, researchers craft an opportunity for them to establish the new suns Butler proclaimed existed.

Furthermore, engaging Black girls in participatory action research can combat the deficit narratives about their group, experiences, and possible educational outcomes (Ozer & Wright, 2012). Doing so not only rejects the negative assumptions about them but also critically interrogates the intentions of those narratives by acting as forms of resistance (Collins, 2000). Pervasive beliefs about Black girls are rooted in negative perceptions of them, their cultures, and actions where they are subjectively regarded as loud (Lei, 2003; Morris, 2007), rude (Morris, 2015; Wun, 2015), sexually promiscuous (Carter Andrews et al., 2019; Daniel & White, 2018; Epstein et al., 2017), and aggressive or threatening (Amuchie, 2016; Annamma et al., 2019; Smith, 2016).

As highlighted in Kelly’s (2020) study, by nature of their identities and the resulting interlocking racism and sexism they face, Black girls possess a unique awareness of their world(s). They utilize this heightened sense of awareness as a form of resistance. In educational spaces, when Black girls reject behavioral expectations of white femininity and respectability that value silence and invisibility, these mischaracterizations affect their classroom experiences thereby contributing to greater mistreatment in the forms of school pushout and exclusion from pedagogical activities (Blake et al., 2011; Blake et al., 2015; Evans-Winters et al., 2018). Thus, it is critical that Black girls participate in the disruption of deficit narratives and the creation of positive counter-narratives.

Ault (2017) reported that the participating Black adolescent female students utilized the YPAR study as a space to “push back on [negative] stereotypes and oppressions” about their racialized and gendered group (p. 132). This study aided the Black girls’ development of a critical understanding of themselves, their agency, and their history, which led them to redefine themselves as royalty throughout the duration of the project in an effort to reframe the deficit
narratives often associated with their identities. Moreover, participants not only rejected and reframed the narratives but also illuminated their subversive strategies against systems and structures that sought to constrain them. This benefit was also present in Duke and Fripp’s (2022) study where participants learned about historical Black American women who were not often mentioned in the girls’ educational journeys. Learning about the accomplishments of Black women contributed to development of counter-narratives for the participants while challenging the “dominant discourse on African American women’s role in American history” (p. 102). This aided many of the girls in dismantling the popularly-held negative stereotypes about their identity group.

Research conducted in academic settings can place greater value on knowledge that derives from those involved in higher education spaces, regarding all other knowledge as less trustworthy. As an epistemological approach, YPAR disrupts this valuing of traditional, academic-centered knowledge over the experiential understanding of those at the center of the research issues (Caraballo et al., 2017). YPAR challenges “who has the right to produce and disseminate knowledge by placing students at the center of knowledge production” (Carabello et al., 2017, p. 315). This disruption is a direct challenge to traditional knowledge value. It is rooted in youth’s understanding of their inherent intellectual and epistemological worth, where varied forms of expertise are cherished. Garcia et al. (2022) argue that Delgado Bernal’s (1998) concept of cultural intuition encourages researchers to employ their personal, lived experiences in the research processes whereby they rely on their experiential knowledge to guide them in interpreting and analyzing collected data. For Black girls who engage in this disruption process as co-researchers, they utilize their cultural intuition to challenge the idea that their intellectual and experiential contributions to research are not valued as highly as the understandings of academia.

Challenging educational policies

In addition to providing participants with the critical thinking and analytic skills to make meaning of their worlds, YPAR can also be a gateway to social justice and resistance for youth co-researchers (Caraballo et al., 2017). Their resistance may be the result of challenging policies and practices that seek to oppress them. The findings from Davis (2019) suggest that engaging in participatory action research can be an “intervention for dismantling systems in youth’s schools and community” (p. 234). At the conclusion of the study, some of the participating youth were inspired to continue their efforts of systemic social change and developed programmatic initiatives to better the educational experiences of other Black female students. This dedication to sustained activism as a result of engaging in the YPAR process positions Black girls as leaders in their fight for social justice. Instead of receiving the result of poor policy implementation, they can participate in the redevelopment processes by using their daily knowledge to inform and create liberatory policies.

For example, when discussing punitive school discipline policies, given that Black girls experience suspension and expulsion at higher rates than their gender peers, they need to be at the center of interrogating and dismantling these policies (Annamma et al., 2016; Crenshaw et al., 2015; Goff, 2016; Wun, 2015). They often suffer the brunt of these harmful school-based policies and practices and should employ their expertise regarding the policies’ impact on their educational experiences.
Challenging educational policies may also lead to more inclusive, safer learning spaces for Black girls. Currently, schools can be regarded as unsafe educational environments for Black girls where they are robbed of their “racialized, gendered, and cultural identities in order to impose a White middle-class Eurocentric standard of beauty, morality, and behavior(s)” (Evans-Winters et al., 2018, pp. 3-4). When they do not comply with or conform to these standards, they are punished and harmed.

Resistance as a by-product of a deepened social consciousness can position Black girls as leaders of systemic change. There is still much to be understood about the ontological and epistemological navigational methods of Black female students as they process their world(s) (Joseph et al., 2016). Simply put, they are an understudied portion of students, with much to teach educators, policymakers, researchers, and other groups about their methods of movement throughout gendered, racialized, and sexualized worlds (Annamma et al., 2016). Solórzano and Delgado-Bernal (2001) assert that when youth employ a deeper level of analysis and understanding regarding their social contexts, they resist those contexts through a transformational process that seeks to change the world around them. Engaging Black girls in YPAR can lead to the challenging and resisting of punitive policies and practices that impact them.

Creating social change

As suggested above, those closest to social ills are often the best equipped to lead in the creation of solutions. Through a critical analysis of social inequities, youth who participate in YPAR can spur systemic social justice changes related to those societal wrongs (Cammarota & Fine, 2008). In the case of Black girls conducting YPAR, they should be supported in their desire to dismantle the systems that seek to erase, devalue, and harm them while being looked toward and listened to in their explanations of the impact of misogynoiristic policies. Black women and girls have always been at the forefront of historic movements for social change. Pauli Murray, a queer Black woman activist, originated the argument that segregation violated fundamental constitutional rights, which would be used by Thurgood Marshall and the other attorneys in the historic Brown v. Board of Education (1954) Supreme Court case (Schulz, 2017). Claudette Colvin, often excluded from the discourse surrounding the Montgomery Bus Boycott, was a fifteen-year-old Black girl who refused to give up her seat on a public, segregated bus in 1955, nine months before Rosa Parks. However, instead of being heralded as a Civil Rights icon, she was placed on indefinite probation, only to have her record cleared over six decades later.

Despite being the luminaries of movements for equity, Black girls are often left out of or purposefully erased from the recounting of civil progress and social justice. Moreover, their needs are often lost in the gender- or race-specific discussions of inequities (Crenshaw, 1991). Consequently, they continue to be harmed and neglected by systems that do not acknowledge their intersectional identities and strictly choose to see them as either Black or female, ignoring how the nexus lends itself to a unique experience (Smith, 2016).

In 2014 when President Barack Obama created the My Brothers’ Keeper initiative, a federal effort to address the systemic, gender-specific educational inequities that boys of color were facing, many female scholars challenged the exclusion of Black girls and their unique needs, calling for their centering in programmatic interventions (Crenshaw et al., 2015; Goff, 2016; Wun, 2016). Without this interrogation of an exclusionary initiative meant to tackle
educational outcomes, the research centering Black girls, their experiences, and methods of thriving and subversion, might have continued to be overshadowed and underpromoted.

Implications and recommendations

There aren’t many educational policies that directly address youths’ needs based on the intersection of their gender and race. For example, the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA), a continuation of the 2001 No Child Left Behind (NCLB) federal law, does not include race when viewing reported discipline data, leaving room for misinterpretations about the disciplinary experiences of children of color (Evans-Winters et al., 2018). Projects utilizing YPAR can inform policymakers’ decisions with implications for the implementations of those policies. By including Black girls in the research processes, the resulting policies may be better crafted to address, and perhaps even begin to remedy, their needs.

Research that centers Black elementary- and middle-school aged girls could highlight their different or similar experiences and those of high school Black girls. Given that Black girls are not monolithic but may share similar experiences, this distinction warrants exploration. Pre-adolescent Black girls may employ their own modes of resistance to systems that do not value their full identities. As indicated through the numerous experiences of elementary school-aged Black girls who have been handcuffed, harassed, and inappropriately handled by local and school-based police officers while in educational environments, it is clear that misogynoir is not limited to an age group (Morris, 2015). Black girls unfortunately experience gendered racism at early ages and deserve the space to interpret and interrogate those negative experiences. Through YPAR, younger Black girls could engage in meaning making while educating others about their specific, age-appropriate needs.

Moreover, research in rural communities should be increased to learn from the genius of Black girls who have access to varied resources that may not be present in a metropolitan area. Rural communities are not often included in the discourse surrounding cities or states that face systemic barriers and Black girls within and from those geographic locations may present their own set of needs and experiences. Diving deeper into these communities with local Black girls leading the exploration and research processes may lend itself to a unique set of solutions to resist sexism and racism in those communities. Given the outcomes associated with participating in the studies that centered urban school settings, it stands to reason that Black girls in rural communities could benefit from employing their critical thinking and analysis skills within their social and educational contexts.

Black girls can aid researchers, educators, and policymakers in understanding their approaches to problem solving, epistemic disruption, and meaning making. As explored by other scholars, YPAR is a pedagogical and methodological tool. Davis (2019) argued that through YPAR, researchers can engage Black girls in critical problem solving to further process the social justice inequities they encounter. Instead of conducting research on Black girls where they are simply regarded as subjects of inquiry, we as researchers must intentionally engage them as co-researchers, fully equipped to collect and analyze data and share findings. Additionally, Black girls can be involved in the dissemination of key insights by crafting spaces that allow them to speak to their experiences as they relate to the research process and findings.

Furthermore, research conducted by Black girls should inspire and revolutionize, not be inaccessible through systemic, linguistic, or dissemination barriers. The resulting disruption of epistemic hierarchies associated with YPAR participation should be shared in community with
others who experience similar results of the explored social inequities. For example, to deeply understand the impact of harsh school discipline policies and practices on Black girls’ educational experiences, researchers could organize a communal conversation that invites participants and their families, community members, and school leaders to listen as Black girls discuss their experiences with these policies. The forum should intentionally center their voices and expertise. Their knowledge should be regarded as valid and instrumental in the construction of remedies.

Discussion

Youth participatory action research (YPAR) is a growing methodological and epistemological approach to centering young people in the creation of solutions to systemic inequities. Through YPAR, Black girls make meaning by invoking their knowledge about their experiences in and with gendered and racialized worlds to create systemic educational policy and social justice change. Their understandings should be valued and considered essential to the development of programmatic initiatives created and implemented to address their needs.

This manuscript built on the existing empirical and theoretical literature related to Black girls in YPAR, outlining the numerous benefits of their inclusion, including policy implications, and called for the creation of studies that feature younger Black female participants, and those within non-urban settings, highlighting the necessity of their participation in the dismantling of misogynoiristic policies. By including an array of age groups and geographic settings, researchers can illuminate a robust understanding of Black girls’ needs, particularly related to school disciplinary practices and policies. The research conducted with Black girls should be grounded in the belief and understanding that they are agentic, innovative, and possess the expertise necessary to craft the world they deserve.

References


Class, and Gender in Teaching and Teacher Education.

https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004365209_010


https://doi.org/10.1080/09650792.2020.1774404


https://doi.org/10.1080/10665684.2022.2047413


